## An integrated methodology to solve optimization problems with Petri nets as disjunctive constraints.

Juan Ignacio Latorre, Emilio Jiménez, Mercedes Pérez

Grupo de Modelado, Simulación y Optimización.
Universidad de La Rioja

## Methodology for decision taking based on alternatives aggregation Petri nets

## Motivation

1. Research the application to the design problem of a DES of classical performance optimization techniques (which have been used extensively for the operation of a DES).
2. Develop a decision support methodology for the design of a DES with optimal operational behaviour as a complement to structural techniques.
3. Improve the efficiency of classical performance optimization techniques based on Petri net models.

# Methodology for decision taking based on alternatives aggregation Petri nets 

## Contents

1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system (DES)
$\downarrow$
2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net
3. Optimization problem based on an undefined Petri net
4. Conclusions

## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

## Outline

Undefined discrete event system
Undefined characteristics that allow to take a decision
Of design (~structure)
Of operation (~behaviour)
Decision problem
Question on a set of undefined characteristics.

## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

Example 1
Decision problem
Design of an industrial facility

Two alternative suppliers
universidad de la rioja


## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

## Example 1 Undefined characteristics

## Of design

Feeding: Lenght of the conveyor.
Feeding: Number of robots.
FMS: Presence and capacity of the input buffer.
FMS: Distributions of the machining centres.
FMS: Number of robots.
FMS: Size of the output buffer.
System of assembly and packing (two alternative options). Assembly and packing: Number of robots.

Of operation
Feeding: Number of pallets of raw materials in the wharehouse.
Feeding: Capacity of the pallets.
Manufacturing sequence of the products.

## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

## Example 1 <br> Decision problem

Specify the undefined characteristics
to obtain the maximal financial performance from the facility.


## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system



## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

## Undefined characteristics Example 2

## Of design

Transport: Number of AGV to acquire and set up.

Of operation
Manufacturing: Manufacturing strategy (push, pull, hybrid).
Manufacturing: Size of the manufacturing lot.
Transport: Size of the transport lot.
Transport: Number of routes for the AGV.

## 1. Decision problem based on a discrete event system

## Decision problem <br> Example 2

Specify the manufacturing strategy
to obtain the maximal financial performance from the facility.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Formalization

Algorithmic solution of the problem
It is necessary to formalize the data of the problem:
Expression in an unambiguous format.
Transformation of the system in a formal model.
Formalism of the Petri nets (for DES).
Possibility to use the model to perform operations of:
Simulation and optimization.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Paradigm of the Petri nets

Matrix-based definition of Petri net (unmarked):
4 -tuple $\mathrm{N}=<P, T$, $\mathrm{Pre}=W^{-}$, Post $\left.=W^{+}\right\rangle$.
$P$ is the set of places (state variables).
$T$ is the set of transitions (transform the values of the state variables).
$\mathbf{C}=$ Post - Pre are the incidence matrices.(arc weights between nodes).
Definition of Petri net system (marked):
Couple $<\mathrm{N}, m_{0}>$.
$m_{0}$ is the initial marking (initial state vector).

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Formalism of the Petri nets

Evolution:
Evolution rule (firing of transitions).
Characteristic or fundamental equation (spurious solutions).

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{m}=\boldsymbol{m}_{0}+\mathbf{C} \cdot \sigma, \text { where } \\
& \boldsymbol{m} \text { is the final marking (state vector of the system) } \\
& \sigma \text { is the firing count (or Parikh) vector. }
\end{aligned}
$$

State space: set of reachable markings.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Formalism of the Petri nets

Double representation


$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { Matrix } \\
\mathrm{W}\left(R_{1}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{cc}
-1 & 1 \\
\mathbf{t}_{1} & \mathbf{t}_{2} \\
2 & -2
\end{array}\right) \quad \begin{array}{l}
\mathbf{p}_{1} \\
\mathbf{p}_{2}
\end{array}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Formalism of the Petri nets

Places (state variables)


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Formalism of the Petri nets

Transitions (transformers of state variables)


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Outline

## Undefined Petri net

Paradigm for modelling DES with parallel and concurrent evolution.

Undefined parameters that model undefined characteristics of the discrete event system.

1. Structural
2. Of transition firing (priorities in conflicts)
3. Marking
4. Interpretation

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Outline

Definition of undefined parameter of a Petri net:
$\beta$ is said to be a parameter of a PN $\boldsymbol{R}$ if it represents a numerical value in the PN model.
$\alpha_{k}$ is said to be an undefined parameter of a PN $\boldsymbol{R}$ iff

$$
\exists S_{\text {valokk }}(\boldsymbol{R})=\left\{v_{i} \mid 1 \leq i \leq \mathrm{q}\right\}, \text { known, where } \operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valok }}(\boldsymbol{R})\right)=\mathrm{q}>1
$$

The assignment $\alpha_{\mathrm{k}}=v_{j}$ is made as a result of a decision.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Outline

## Definition of an undefined Petri net system:

7 -tuple $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}=<P, T$, Pre, Post, $m_{0}, S_{\alpha}, S_{\text {val }}>$ that verifies:

- $\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\alpha}\right)>0$ (There exists at least one undefined parameter in $R^{c}$ ).
- $\forall \alpha_{i} \in S_{\alpha}, \operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valoi }}\right)>1$ (It is possible to take a decision on the value of every undefined parameter), which implies that $\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valai }}\right)>1$.
Where: $S_{\alpha}$ is the set of undefined parameters in $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}$.
$S_{\text {val } \alpha}$ is the set of feasible combinations of values for the undefined parameters of $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}$.
$S_{\text {valoi }}$ is the set of feasible values for the undefined parameter $\alpha_{i} \in S_{\alpha}$


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Undefined Petri net

Parameters of an undefined Petri net


$$
S_{\alpha}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=S_{\text {stro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}\right)
$$

Feasible combination of values for the undefined structural parameters

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0), \\
(0,1,1,1,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Undefined Petri net

Representations of an undefined Petri net
Objectives:

- To find different equivalent representations of the undefined Petri net.
- To use those different representations to solve a decision problem in an efficient way, profiting from the characteristics of the representations.
- To understand the relation between different representations of the undefined PN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Definition of partition

Given a set $S_{\text {valstr o }}\left(R^{c}\right)$ with the feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters of $R^{c}$.

It can be defined a partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)$ as the set $\left\{S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{1}\right), S_{\text {valstro o }}\left(R_{2}\right), \ldots, S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{n r}\right)\right\}$ such that:
i. $S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R^{c}\right)=S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{1}\right) \cup S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{2}\right) \cup \ldots \cup S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{n r}\right)$
ii. $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{i}\right) \neq \varnothing, 1 \leq i \leq n_{r}$
iii. $S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{i}\right) \cap S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{j}\right)=\varnothing, 1 \leq i, j \leq n_{r}$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Example of partitions

The set of 3 elements $S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R^{c}\right)=\{a, b, c\}$ can generate 5 different partitions:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\{a\},\{b\},\{c\} \\
\{a\},\{b, c\} \\
\{b\},\{a, c\} \\
\{c\},\{a, b\} \\
\{a, b, c\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Alternative Petri net systems

Given:

- An undefined Petri net system $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}=<P, T$, Pre, Post, $m_{0}, S_{\alpha}, S_{\text {valo }}>$, where $\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {stra }}\right)>0\left(\right.$ hence $\left.\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valstr } \alpha}\right)>1\right)$.
- A partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right),\left\{S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{1}\right), S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{2}\right), \ldots, S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{n r}\right)\right\}$

It is possible to define a set of alternative $\mathrm{PN} S_{R}=\left\{R_{1}, \ldots, R_{n r}\right\}$, where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& R_{i} \text { is given by }<P, T \text {, Pre, Post, } m_{0}, S_{\alpha}\left(R_{i}\right), S_{\text {valo }}\left(R_{i}\right)> \\
& S_{\text {str } \alpha}\left(R_{i}\right) \subseteq S_{\alpha}\left(R_{i}\right) \subseteq S_{\alpha} \\
& S_{\text {valstro } \alpha}\left(R_{i}\right) \subseteq S_{\text {valo }}\left(R_{i}\right) \subset S_{\text {valo }}
\end{aligned}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Alternative Petri nets
They are generated from a partition of the set of feasible values for the undefined structural parameters of the undefined PN.

They are exclusive models or sets of models for a DES modelled by an undefined Petri net.

They show a pairwise exclusive evolution.
They have structural differences (incidence matrices).

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Types of alternative Petri nets

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Simple: }\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\text { They lack any undefined structural parameter: } \\
\text { card }\left(S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{i}\right)\right)=1 . \\
\text { They represent a single model for the DES }
\end{array}\right. \\
& \text { Compound: }:\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\text { They contain undefined structural parameters: } \\
\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valstra }}\left(R_{j}\right)\right)>1 \\
\text { Set of exclusive models for a DES }
\end{array}\right.
\end{aligned}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Equivalent representations

( Equivalence $=$ same behaviour / graph of reachable markings )

- Compound Petri net: $S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R^{c}\right)=\{a, b, c\}$
- Set of simple alternative Petri nets: $\{a\},\{b\},\{c\}$
- Set of compound alternative Petri nets.
- Mixed set of compound alternative and simple alternative Petri nets: $\{a\},\{b, c\}$ or $\{b\},\{a, c\}$ or $\{b\},\{a, c\}$.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 <br> Compound Petri net

## Partition $\{a, b, c\}$

Feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters ( $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}$ )

$$
S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0),(0,1,1,1,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3

## Compound Petri net



Undefined structural parameters

$$
\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}\right)
$$

undefined structural parameters

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0) \\
(0,1,1,1,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 <br> Simple alternative Petri nets

## Partition $\{a\},\{b\},\{c\}$

Feasible combination of values for the undefined structural parameters ( $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}$ )

$$
\begin{aligned}
S_{\text {valstro }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{1}\right) & =\{(0,2,0,0,0)\} \\
S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{2}\right) & =\{(0,1,1,1,0)\} \\
S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{3}\right) & =\{(1,2,0,1,2)\}
\end{aligned}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 <br> Simple alternative Petri nets


$R_{2}$


$$
S^{{ }^{\text {valstro } \alpha}}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{1}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0)\} \quad S_{\text {valstro }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{2}\right)=\{(0,1,1,1,0)\} \quad S_{\text {valstro }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{3}\right)=\{(1,2,0,1,2)\}
$$

universidad de la riona
de zaragoza

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Simple alternative Petri nets

Usual input in a decision problem based on a DES:

- Different alternative systems for the design of the DES.
- Those alternative systems usually can be modelled by means of PN models with differences in their incidence matrices.
- They can be represented by:
- A set of alternative PN.
- A compound PN with undefined structural parameters.
- A mixed set of simple and compound alternative PN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 Mixed set of simple alternative PN

## Partition $\{a, b\},\{c\}$

Feasible combination of values for the undefined structural parameters ( $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}$ )

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{\text {valstro }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{12}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0),(0,1,1,1,0)\} \\
S^{o}{ }_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{3}\right)=\{(1,2,0,1,2)\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 Mixed set of simple alternative PN



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 2nd. Set of alternative Petri nets

## Partition $\{a, c\},\{b\}$

Feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters ( $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}$ )

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{\text {valstro }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{13}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\} \\
S^{o}{ }_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{2}\right)=\{(0,1,1,1,0)\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 2nd. Set of alternative Petri nets



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 3rd. Set of alternative Petri nets

## Partition $\{a\},\{b, c\}$

Feasible combination of values for the undefined structural parameters ( $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}$ )

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{{ }_{\text {valstro }}^{o}}\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{1}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0)\} \\
S_{\text {valstrod }}^{o}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{23}\right)=\{(0,1,1,1,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\}
\end{gathered}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 3 3rd. Set of alternative Petri nets



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Equivalence classes

The set $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{i}\right)$, with the feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters of $R_{i}$, define an equivalence class.

Equivalence relation: $R_{i}$ and $R_{j}$ are equivalent if the behaviour is the same (the graph of reachable states are the same or isomorphous).

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Transformations that preserve the equivalence
Operations that allow to transform $R_{i}$ in $R_{j}$, both belonging to the same equivalence class:

1. Addition / removal of a row (column) of zeros in the incidence matrix of $R_{i}$. A row (column) of zeros corresponds to a non-connected place (transition).
2. To swap the position of two rows (column) in the incidence matrix.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Addition / removal of a row of zeros


$R_{1}^{\prime}$
 universidad de la rioja de.zaragoza

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Addition / removal of a column of zeros


universidad de la rioja
Non-connected transition and column of zeros //z Universidad

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Significative elements of an equivalent class
Canonical alternative Petri net.
It lacks non-connected places (transitions).
It is not unique (possible rows/columns swapping).
Set of matching alternative Petri nets.
Set with a representative of every equivalence class.
They have the same set of parameters.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Example of canonical Petri net


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Example of non-matching alternative Petri nets

$R_{1}$
$R_{2}$
$R_{3}$



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Matching alternative Petri nets

A set of matching alternative Petri nets can be transformed in a compound PN by means of a single step (incidence matrices of same sizes).

A set of non-matching alternative PN (for example canonical ones) can be transformed into a set of matching PN:

- Adding or removing rows or columns to make equal the size of the incidence matrices.
- Swapping the order of rows and columns according to a certain
criterion (for example to minimize the number of undefined parameters finding blocks in the incidence matrices that fit).


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Example of matching alternative Petri nets


$\Omega$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Merging of matching alternative PN

The ovelapping/merging of PN is the inverse operation to the partition of a compound PN.

It may be applied to simple alternative PN and/or to compound alternative PN.

Requires that the PN to be merged have the same set of parameters (no matter if they are defined or undefined).

The Petri nets to be merged should be matching Petri nets (they have the same subsets of parameters of every different type).

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Number of equivalence classes
It is named order.
Maximal order $\boldsymbol{n}$ corresponds to: $\boldsymbol{S}_{R}=\left\{\boldsymbol{R}_{1}{ }_{1}, \ldots, \boldsymbol{R}_{n}{ }_{n}\right\}$
Set of simple alternative Petri nets.
Minimal order 1 corresponds to: compound PN $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}$.
Intermediate orders correspond to:
Mixed sets of compound alternative and simple alternative PN.
The order is proportional to the refinement (fragmentation) of the partition.
universidad de la rioja

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Example. Number of equivalence classes
The set of three elements $\{a, b, c\}$ can lead to 5 different partitions with the following orders:
$\{a\},\{b\},\{c\}$ presents order $\mathbf{3}$ (three simple alternative PN)
$\{a\},\{b, c\}$ order $\mathbf{2}$ (one simple and one compound alternative PN)
$\{b\},\{a, c\}$ order 2 (one simple and one compound alternative PN)
$\{c\},\{a, b\}$ order 2 (one simple and one compound alternative PN) $\{a, b, c\}$ order 1 (one compound PN)

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Hasse diagram
Order 1

Order 2

Order 3

$\uparrow$ Refinement
(fragmentation)

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Number of possible decompositions of $\boldsymbol{R}^{c}$ in equivalence classes.
Number of Bell:

$$
B_{n+1}=\sum_{k=0}^{n}\binom{n}{k} B_{k} .
$$

Meaning of the number of Bell:
Number of possible equivalent representations of an undefined Petri net, with $\boldsymbol{n + 1}=$ number of feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

Number of Bell


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Properties of an undefined Petri net

## Equivalent representations

- Compound Petri net.
- Set of simple alternative Petri nets:
- Canonical, matching or others.
- Sets of compound alternative Petri nets.
- Mixed set of compound alternative and simple alternative PN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 1

Decision problem

Design of an industrial facility

Two alternative suppliers


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example $1 \quad$ Simple alternative Petri net $R_{1}$


(17) Universidad de Zaragoza

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example $1 \quad$ Simple alternative Petri net $\boldsymbol{R}_{2}$



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 1 Set of simple alternative Petri nets



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net



Routes of the AGV: inner and outer ones.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Characteristics and parameters

## Design characteristics:

Number of AGV in the system.
Modelled as the number of tokens in the places that represent the AGV.
Undefined marking parameters belonging to the set $\{1, \ldots, 5\}$.

## Operation characteristics:

Manufacturing strategy.
Modelled by means of the weight of arcs that represent work orders.
Undefined structural parameteres belonging to the set $\{0, \ldots, 12\}$.
Manufacturing and transport lot size.
Modelled by the weight of the arcs that represent the flow of parts.
Undefined structural parameteres belonging to the set $\{1, \ldots, 24\}$.
Number of independent routes for the automatic guided vehicles (AGV).
Modelled by means of different subnets.
Undefined structural parameteres belonging to the set $\{0,1\}$.
UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net



$$
R_{1}{ }_{1}
$$

Manufacturing strategy pull.

1 route of AGV.
Undefined structural parameters

Lot sizes.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example $2 \quad$ Compound alternative Petri net


$R^{c}{ }_{3}$
Manufacturing strategy pull.

3 routes of AGV.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net


$\boldsymbol{R}^{c_{7}}, R^{c}{ }_{8}, R^{c}{ }_{9}$
Hybrid manufacturing strategy pull-push.

1, 2 of 3 routes of AGV respectively.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net


$\boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{10}, \boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{11}, \boldsymbol{R}^{c}{ }_{12}$
Hybrid
manufacturing
strategy push-pull.
1, 2 of 3 routes of AGV respectively.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net



## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net



UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA
$\boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{16}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{17}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{18}$
2nd.
manufacturing strategy push.

1, 2 and 3 routes of AGV respectively.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net


$\boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{19}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{20}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{21}$
2nd. hybrid manufacturing strategy pull-push.

1,2 and 3 routes of AGV respectively.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Example 2 Compound alternative Petri net



JIIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA
$\boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{c}}{ }_{22}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\mathbf{c}}{ }_{23}, \boldsymbol{R}^{\mathbf{c}}{ }_{24}$
3rd.
manufacturing strategy pull.

1, 2 and 3 routes of AGV respectively.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Motivation

Is it possible to build up other type of PN from a partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{l}\right)$ different to the alternative PN?

Is it possible to merge the alternative PN to build up a PN which is not a compound PN?
Is it possible to profit from the shared subnets of the alternative PN?
Is it possible to decide wether no undefined structural parameter should appear in the new PN?

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Definition

- Let $R^{c}$ be a compound PN and $\left\{S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{1}\right), S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{2}\right), \ldots, S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{n r}\right)\right\}$ a partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)$.
- Let $S_{A}=\left\{\mathrm{a}_{1}, \mathrm{a}_{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{nr}} \mid \exists \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1,1 \leq i \leq n_{\mathrm{r}} \wedge\right.$ if $\left.\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1 \Rightarrow \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{j}}=0 \forall j \neq i\right\}$ be a set of choice variables, where

$$
\operatorname{card}\left(\left\{S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R_{l}\right), S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{2}\right), \ldots, S_{\text {valstrod }}\left(R_{n r}\right)\right\}\right)=\operatorname{card}\left(S_{A}\right)
$$

The choice of $\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1$ is the result of a decision.
An alternatives aggregation Petri net system is defined as the 8-tuple:

$$
\boldsymbol{R}^{\boldsymbol{A}}=<P, T, \text { Pre, Post, } m_{0}, S_{A}, S_{\alpha}\left(R_{i}\right), S_{\text {valo }}\left(R_{i}\right)>
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Construction algorithm from a compound PN

Given: $\quad R^{c}$ (compound PN)

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left\{S_{\text {lvalstroo }} S_{2 \text { valstroo }} \ldots, S_{2 \text { valstr } \alpha}\right\} \text { (partition of } S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right) \text { ) } \\
& S_{A}=\left\{\mathrm{a}_{1}, \mathrm{a}_{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{nr}} \mid \exists \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1,1 \leq i \leq n_{r} \wedge \text { if } \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1 \Rightarrow \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{j}}=0 \forall j \neq i\right\} \text { (set of choice variables) }
\end{aligned}
$$

a) Create a bijection between $S_{A}$ and the partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)$.
b) Replicate every transition $t_{i}$ into a set $\left\{t_{i}^{1}, t_{i}^{2}, \ldots, t_{i}^{n r}\right\}$ where $n_{r}=\operatorname{card}\left(S_{A}\right)$ and
$\operatorname{Pre}\left(p_{j}, t_{i}\right), \operatorname{Post}\left(t_{i}{ }^{q}, p_{k}\right) \in S_{q v a l o d}\left(R_{q}\right) \cup S_{\text {qvalß }}\left(R_{q}\right)$
The choice variable $\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{q}}$ is associated to the transition $t_{i}$ as a boolean condition.
c) Applicate reduction and simplification rules.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Property

- Let $R^{c}$ be a compound Petri net.
- Let $R^{A}$ be an alternatives aggregation Petri net obtained from $R^{c}$.
- Let us consider an equivalence relation which states that a PN is equivalent to another one when their reachability graph is the same.
- It is possible to state that:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& R^{c} \text { and } R^{A} \text { are equivalent. } \\
& R^{A} \text { will not have any undefined structural parameter if } \\
& \qquad \operatorname{card}\left(S_{A}\right)=\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

- As a consequence, $R^{A}$ is a valid representation of an undefined PN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

Replication of the transitions of $R^{c}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
\operatorname{card}\left(S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)\right)=n_{r} \\
S_{\text {valol }}^{E}\left(R^{c}\right)=\left\{\mathrm{v}_{1}^{1}, \mathrm{v}^{1}{ }_{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{v}^{1}{ }_{\mathrm{nr}}\right\} \\
S_{\text {valo } 2}\left(R^{c}\right)=\left\{\mathrm{v}^{2}{ }_{1}, \mathrm{v}^{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{v}^{2}{ }_{\mathrm{nr}}\right\}
\end{gathered}
$$



The choice of $\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{q}}^{1}$ and $\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{q}}^{1}$ in $R^{c}$ is equivalent to the choice of $\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{q}}$ in $R^{A}$.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Choice variables

- Allow to impose the condicion of exclusive behaviour of the different subsets of a partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(R^{c}\right)$.

To activate a choice variable is equivalent to choose an alternative PN in a set of alternative PNs or to choose a feasible combination of values for the undefined structural parameters in a compound PN.

- A function of choice variables can be associated to a transition.
- Before the beginning of a simulation ("token game") a choice variable must be chosen as a result of a decision.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

Compound $\mathrm{PN} \rightarrow$ Alternatives aggregation PN
Sets of parameters of $R^{c}$ and $R^{A}$ :
Subset

universidad de la rioja

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo $3 \quad$ Obtention of an APN

## Original compound Petri net


universidad de la riona
Feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters $\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}, \alpha_{5}\right)$ :

$$
S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)=\{(0,2,0,0,0),(0,1,1,1,0),(1,2,0,1,2)\}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 1.

Partition of $S_{\text {valstro }}\left(\boldsymbol{R}^{c}\right)$ of order 3: $\{(0,2,0,0,0)\},\{(0,1,1,1,0)\},\{(1,2,0,1,2)\}$
Notice that $\mathrm{n}_{\mathrm{r}}=\operatorname{card}(\{(0,2,0,0,0)\},\{(0,1,1,1,0)\},\{(1,2,0,1,2)\})=3$
Definition of the set of choice variables

$$
S_{A}=\left\{\mathrm{a}_{1}, \mathrm{a}_{2}, \mathrm{a}_{3} \mid \exists \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1,1 \leq i \leq n_{\mathrm{r}} \wedge \text { if } \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1 \Rightarrow \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{j}}=0 \forall j \neq i\right\}
$$

Creation of a bijection between $S_{A}$ and $\{(0,2,0,0,0)\},\{(0,1,1,1,0)\},\{(1,2,0,1,2)\}$
universidad de la rioja


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 2.

Replication of every transition into $n_{r}$ new transitions:
Associate the Pre and Post functions to the subsets of the partition.
Associate tha appropriate choice variable to every transition.
Partition of


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 2.

Replication of every transition into $n_{r}$ new transitions:
Associate the Pre and Post functions to the subsets of the partition.
Associate tha appropriate choice variable to every transition.
Partition of


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 3.

The Petri net is redrawn without the arcs of weight 0 .


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 3.

The Petri net is redrawn without the arcs of weight 0 .


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 4.

An equivalent Petri net is obtained by removing the rows and columns of 0 :
Non-connected places: none
Non-connected transitions: $t_{1}{ }^{3}$ and $t_{2}{ }^{3}$


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 4.

An equivalent Petri net is obtained by removing the rows and columns of 0 :
Non-connected places: none
Non-connected transitions: $t_{1}{ }^{3}$ and $t_{2}{ }^{3}$


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 4.

An equivalent Petri net is obtained by removing the rows and columns of 0 :
Non-connected places: none
Non-connected transitions: $t_{1}^{3}$ and $t_{2}{ }^{3}$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 4.

An equivalent Petri net is obtained by removing the rows and columns of 0 :
Non-connected places: none
Non-connected transitions: $t_{1}{ }^{3}$ and $t_{2}{ }^{3}$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 4.

An equivalent Petri net is obtained by removing the rows and columns of 0 :
Non-connected places: none
Non-connected transitions: $t_{l}{ }^{3}$ and $t_{2}{ }^{3}$

$$
\mathrm{W}\left(R^{A}\right)=\underbrace{\left(\begin{array}{ccccccc}
t_{1}^{1} & t_{2}^{1} & t_{3}^{1} & t_{1}^{2} & t_{2}^{2} & t_{3}^{2} & t_{3}^{3} \\
-1 & -\mathbf{1} & -1 & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1} & -\mathbf{- 1} \\
\mathbf{2} & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{2} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{0} \\
\mathbf{0} & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{2}
\end{array}\right)} \mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{1}}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 5.

Application of a reduction rule to identical transitions:
Function of choice variables associated to the new transitions.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

Step 5.
Application of a reduction rule to identical transitions:
Function of choice variables associated to the new transitions.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

Step 5.
Application of a reduction rule to identical transitions:
Function of choice variables associated to the new transitions.


UNIVERSIDAD DE LA RIOJA

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

## Step 5.

Application of a reduction rule to identical transitions:
Function of choice variables associated to the new transitions.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> Obtention of an AAPN

Step 6.
Redrawing of the alternatives aggregation Petri net.


$$
\mathrm{W}\left(R^{4}\right)=\begin{array}{ccccc}
t_{r}^{1} & t_{2}^{1} & t_{1}^{2} & t_{r}^{2} & t_{3}^{3} \\
\left(\begin{array}{ccccc}
-1 & -1 & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1} & -\mathbf{1} \\
\mathbf{2} & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{0} \\
\mathbf{0} & \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{- 1} & \mathbf{2}
\end{array}\right) \mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{1}} \\
\uparrow & \mathbf{p}_{2} \\
\mathrm{p}_{1}+\mathrm{a}_{3} & \mathrm{a}_{2} & \mathrm{a}_{1} & \uparrow & \mathrm{a}_{3} \\
a_{2}+\mathrm{a}_{3}
\end{array}
$$

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Ejemplo 3 <br> AAPN and compound PN

## Comparison.

Graphical and algebraic representations:


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## AAPN and compound Petri nets

## Comparison

- Size of the incidence matrices: greater in the AAPN.
- Size of feasible combinations of values for the undefined structural parameters: greater in the compound PN.
- Computer time needed to impose the initial conditions for a simulation: greater in the compound PN.
- Computer time needed to compute the incidence matrix: greater in the AAPN.
- Complexity of the software: higher in the compound Petri net (imposition of the initial conditions). Reuse of CPN software for AAPN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Property

- Let $R^{4}$ be an alternatives aggregation Petri net.
- Let us consider an equivalence relation which states that a PN is equivalent to another one when their reachability graph is the same.
- There exists a coloured Petri net $R$ such that:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& R^{A} \text { and } R \text { are equivalent. } \\
& \text { if } S_{\text {stro }}\left(R^{A}\right)=\varnothing \Rightarrow S_{\text {strod }}(R)=\varnothing
\end{aligned}
$$

- As a consequence, the coloured Petri net $R$ is a valid representation of an undefined PN .


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Construction algorithm of a CPN from an AAPN

Given: $\quad R^{A}$ (Alternatives aggregation Petri net)

$$
S_{A}=\left\{\mathrm{a}_{1}, \mathrm{a}_{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{nr}} \mid \exists \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1,1 \leq i \leq n_{r} \wedge \text { if } \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}=1 \Rightarrow \mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{j}}=0 \forall j \nexists i\right\} \text { (set of choice variables) }
$$

a) Create a set of choice colours $S_{C}=\left\{\mathrm{c}_{1}, \mathrm{c}_{2}, \ldots, \mathrm{c}_{\mathrm{nr}}\right\}$.
b) Create a bijection between $S_{A}$ and $S_{C}$.
c) Impose the condition of monochrome initial choice colours (mutual exclusion):
$\exists \mathrm{c}_{\mathrm{i}}=1,1 \leq i \leq n_{\mathrm{r}} \wedge$ if $\mathrm{c}_{\mathrm{i}}=1 \Rightarrow \mathrm{c}_{\mathrm{j}}=0 \forall j \neq i$.
d) In every transition of $R^{A}$ substitute every $\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{i}}$ by $\mathrm{c}_{\mathrm{i}}$. As a result, the coloured PN $R$ will be obtained.
e) Associate a choice colour to every initial marking.

## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Coloured PN obtained from an AAPN

- As a consequence of the equivalence between an AAPN and a CPN:
- Results from AAPN can be applied to CPN.
- Results from CPN can be applied to AAPN.
- Software developed for CPN can be applied to AAPN.
- Optimization procedures for the design of DES developed for AAPN can be applied using CPN and simulation / optimization software for CPN.


## 2. Decision problem based on an undefined Petri net

## Alternatives aggregation Petri nets (AAPN)

## Coloured PN obtained from an AAPN

- The simulation of the evolution of an AAPN can be performed through its equivalent CPN. Therefore it is not necessary any specific software.
- There are equivalent representations of an undefined PN:
- Compound PN.
- Set of alternative PN (simple, compound or mixed) in an amount given by the number of Bell.
- Alternatives aggregation PN.
- Coloured Petri net.

